



CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

May 21, 2009

AMENDED MEETING MINUTES

(Removed language appears with a ~~strike through~~, added language appears with an underline)

Thursday, May 21, 2009, 2:00 PM at the Northwest Neighborhood Center, 2160 N. 6th Ave. Tucson, Arizona.

Primary CCC Members in Attendance

- Jonathan Overpeck, UA Institute for the Study of the Environment
- Andy Laurenzi, Center for Desert Archaeology
- Phil Swaim, Swaim Associates
- Paul Green, Tucson Audubon Society
- Pat Patton, UA Eller School of Business
- Jane Poynter, Paragon Space Development Corp
- John Schwarz, University of Arizona (retired)
- Joanie Sawyer, PRO Neighborhoods

Alternate CCC Members in Attendance

- Gregg Garfin, UA Institute for the Study of the Environment
- Curtis Lueck, Curtis Lueck and Associates
- Rich Michal, Adolfson and Peterson Construction
- Neil Markowitz, Environmental Education Exchange
- Sofia Loomis, Realty Executives
- Bryant Nodine, TUSD
- Terry Galligan, Old Pueblo Community Foundation
- Julie Evans, Native Seeds/SEARCH
- Barbara Warren, Physicians for Social Responsibility (retired M.D.)

Staff in Attendance

- David Schaller, Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD)
- Nicole Urban-Lopez, OCSD
- Leslie Liberti, OCSD
- Ann Audrey, OCSD
- Laura Burge, Ward VI

Public in Attendance

- Tedra Fox, Pima County
- Susanne Cotty, PAG
- Lee Comrie, PAG
- Donna Branch-Gilby, Milagro Co-housing

AGENDA ITEMS

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

- A quorum was established and the meeting commenced at 2:06 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions

- David Schaller reported that the CCC members were emailed a copy of the Open Meeting Law requirements and are expected to act in accordance with those regulations. He also reminded the committee that a violation of the Open Meeting Law can result in fines and other consequences.
- David reported that per the ordinance that created the CCC, only Primary members can serve as Co-chairs. The ordinance also allows the CCC to appoint additional people as non-voting advisory committee members.
- David reported that the Chairman of the House Select Committee on Energy Independence and Global Warming has asked the General Accounting Office to conduct a study on climate change adaptation and the City of Tucson has been asked to participate in a web survey as part of that study.
- David reported that CCC member Ana Maria Lopez has an intern that can help the committee throughout the summer, starting after July 4th.
- An updated contact list was distributed and the committee was asked to make any final corrections to the information listed.
- A compilation of recent news articles regarding international climate change efforts was distributed to the committee.

3. Approval of Minutes for April 30, 2009

- Jane Poynter moved to approve the April 30, 2009 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Joanie Sawyer. Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 8 to 0.

4. Selection of Co-chairs

- Per the ordinance that created the CCC, Co-chairs serve a 2 year term and members cannot serve for more than one consecutive term in a 4 year period.
- Jane Poynter indicated she was interested in serving as a Co-chair.
- Jane Poynter nominated Tomas Leon as a Co-chair. Barbara Warren seconded the motion. Tomas was not present to accept the nomination. The motion was tabled until the next CCC meeting. Staff will discuss the nomination with Tomas in advance of the next meeting.
- Time availability was expressed as a desired quality in the Co-chairs.
- OCSD staff will provide the following support to the committee:
 - o Logistics of meeting preparation
 - o Technical expertise
 - o Follow through on committee requests for information
- Staff indicated that committee members can swap primary/alternate positions if an alternate wants to serve as a Co-chair and the primary member agrees to the change.
- Neil Markowitz moved to elect Jane Poynter as Co-chair. The motion was seconded by Terry Galligan. Motion was approved unanimously by voice vote of 8 to 0.
- It was asked if staff could facilitate the committee meetings instead of the Co-chairs. Staff indicated that the committee could request the staff to take on this role. This usually happens in other advisory committees when the discussion topics may be contentious.
- Staff reported that the Climate committee in Denver hired a professional facilitator during their planning process.
- Staff was directed to research the possibility of using a third party facilitator for future meetings.

5. Selection of ongoing committee meeting schedule

- Staff reported that Committee members will be removed from the committee if they miss 4 consecutive meetings or 40% of the meetings in a calendar year.
- Staff will send out a doodle poll to schedule the next meeting for either June 19th or June 23rd at 2 p.m.
- The committee would like to schedule meetings on a set day each month.
- Staff was directed to send out a doodle poll to help determine a set monthly schedule, to be determined at the next CCC meeting.

6. Presentation on Pima County's Sustainability Program

- The following presentation was given by Tedra Fox from Pima County.

- The Pima County Board of Supervisors adopted a Resolution on May 1, 2007 containing a broad range of sustainability initiatives.
- In response, staff established a Sustainability Steering Committee.
- The Committee outlined three spheres of sustainability:
 - o Pima County operations- lead by doing
 - o Community scale- what services does the County provide that can enhance sustainability in the community
 - o Regional scale- Public/private partnerships
- First phase: County operations
 - o This phase has been completed. The Board of Supervisors adopted a Sustainable Action Plan on August 18, 2008, which included 119 actions. The Plan is available at www.pima.gov
 - Carbon action: staff is in the process of creating a comprehensive energy management plan which will include greenhouse gas emissions reduction goals.
 - Green building: all new County government buildings must meet LEED Silver standards. The County also adopted a voluntary Green Building program.
 - Renewable energy and conservation: 15% of the energy the County uses must come from renewable sources by 2025.
 - o A sustainability report card will be issued annually, beginning in August 2009.
- The health effects of climate change are not addressed in the current operational plan, but may be included in the Comprehensive Plan update. This is a topic the County would like to address in a Community Sustainability Plan.
- Tedra was asked if any studies have been done to determine the impediments to solar installations in the County. It was clarified that HOAs cannot prohibit solar installations on residential units, and they cannot require any changes that result in a higher installation cost or that diminish the ability to access solar energy. Tedra and City staff reported that the primary issue seems to be cost and the long payback period.
- Staff reported that there is legislation that has been introduced into the State legislature, HB 2335, which expands the ability of Cities to use municipal improvement districts. The bill would permit an improvement district to be formed for the purpose of acquisition, installation, and improvement of energy, renewable energy, and water conservation sources, efficiency, and management. An additional tax assessment would be instituted so that borrowing against that revenue stream could occur. Homeowners would then pay back the cost of solar installations through yearly payments with their property taxes. This effectively attaches the cost of the infrastructure to the home, not the homeowner. HB 2336 extends the same provisions to Counties.
- It was commented that the City and County should provide clear guidelines to homeowners about the laws that govern/protect access to solar.
- Staff was directed to poll some local solar installers to find out what they think is the biggest impediment to widespread solar use in Tucson.

7. **Presentation on 2008 Regional Greenhouse Gas Inventory**

- The following presentation was given by Susanne Cotty from PAG.
- The 2008 Regional Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Inventory has four components:
 - o Eastern Pima County
 - o City of Tucson
 - o Pima County government operations
 - o City of Tucson government operations
- The goals of the inventory were to determine how many ghg emissions are being produced and the sources of those emissions.
- Trends from 1990 through 2006 were included in the inventory, but the presentation includes data from 1990-2007.
- The CACP model was used (clean air and climate protection), which was developed for use by local governments.
- The model calculates ghg emissions and expresses them as carbon dioxide equivalents (CO₂e). Local data is put into the model and emissions factors are used to calculate ghg emissions.
- Eastern Pima County trends

- From 1990-~~2006~~ 2007, there was a ~~46%~~ 56% increase in ghg emissions, which correlates closely with the population increase which was about 50% during that same time period.
 - It was clarified that ghg emissions data from Tucson are included in the eastern Pima County model.
 - The County model includes fuel use data from Phelps Dodge, Portland Cement, and the mines
- It was asked if the model accounts for alternative energy use and how this is determined. Susanne explained that data about alternative energy use was entered into the model.
- City of Tucson trends
 - From 1990-~~2006~~ 2007, there was a 42% increase in ghg emissions, which correlates with a population increase of about 34% during the same time period.
 - Energy use accounts for about 2/3 of the ghg emissions.
 - It was asked whether the data shows that the actual per capita emissions have increased because if they had remained neutral the increase in ghg emissions would equal the population increase. It might be useful to compare sector growth to ghg emissions growth by sector to help identify the fastest growing emitters.
- City of Tucson government operations
 - Tucson government operations only account for about 3% of total city emissions.
 - Between 2000-2007 there was about a 6% decrease in ghg emissions
 - Staff reported that Tucson Water delivers water to about 75% of County residents and the associated ghg emissions are captured in the Tucson government operations model.
 - The model does not include CAP pumping, but that data is currently being gathered.
 - It was noted that sewer and wastewater-related emissions are captured in the County government operations model.
- Food that is produced locally is captured in the models, but not food that is imported. The only agricultural-attributed emissions included are those reflected in industrial electricity and natural gas usage. Emissions from fertilizers are not included.
- Emissions from the mines were not included in the inventory.
- The inventory presented both process and fuel use emissions from Arizona Portland Cement. Phelps Dodge fuel use emissions and Arizona Portland Cement process and fuel use emissions were documented in the report but not included in the totals because 1990 data were not available.
- The emissions from aircraft fuel use at 3 local airports are listed in the inventory but are not included in the totals because 1990 data from all airports were not available. The models do not include the airport because they could not obtain 1990 data. Davis Monthan is not included either, but other regional airports are included in the models.
- It was commented that there are biases inherent to modeling and it may not be worth probing and refining the model since the biases exist throughout the model.
- It was commented that probing further into the data instead of refining the model might be a beneficial exercise for understanding the data better. This may be a topic for a subcommittee to research and report back on.
- Susanne pointed out that each year has a different TEP emissions factor, so a reduction in use doesn't always translate into a reduction in ghg emissions. The emissions factors are listed on page ~~48~~ 44 of the Regional Greenhouse Gas Inventory.
- The CACP model accepts potential reduction measures and calculates emissions and savings. Staff will be using this software with CCC to estimate ghg reductions for various strategies.

8. Presentation on Denver's Climate Action Plan

- The following presentation was given by David Schaller from OCSD.
- The goal used for the plan was a 10% reduction in ghg emissions over 1990 levels per capita. Because of population increases, achieving the goal still resulted in a 16% net increase of ghg emissions. As a result, the committee recommended an absolute reduction of ghg emissions of 25% over 1990 levels by 2020 in the plan.
- The Mayor of Denver signed the Climate Action Plan and some strategies are currently being implemented.
- The Denver GreenPrint plan is available at:
<http://www.greenprintdenver.org/docs/DenverClimateActionPlan.pdf>

9. Asset mapping exercise to identify additional stakeholders that should be aware of the CCC planning process

- This item was tabled until the next meeting.

10. Future Agenda Items

- John Schwarz moved to approve the following future agenda items:
 - o Asset mapping exercise to identify additional stakeholders that should be aware of the CCC planning process
 - o Develop a roadmap for the committee's work
 - o Selection of Co-chair
 - o Selection of future meeting schedule
- The motion was seconded by Barbara Warren. Motion was approved unanimously by a voice vote of 8 to 0.

11. Call to the Audience

12. Adjournment at 4:14 p.m.
